

**An Original Approach to the Intricacies of Warsh’s Transmission
Review on: Feyizli Hasan Tahsin. The Comparison of Warsh’s
and Hafs’s Transmissions in ‘Ilm al-Qira’at. İstanbul:
Kökler Derneği Yayınları, 2020. 184 p.**

Vugar Garadaghli

PhD (Philology), Lecturer, Department of Arabic Philology
Baku State University
33, Akad. Z. Khalilov Str., Baku, AZ1148, Azerbaijan
garadaghlivugar@gmail.com
ORCID: 0000-0002-5282-4752

The review is dedicated to the work “The Comparison of Warsh’s and Hafs’s Transmissions in ‘Ilm al-Qira’at” written in Arabic by Turkish scholar, professor of the European Islamic University Hasan Tahsin Feyizli, published in Istanbul in 2020. The research compares the transmission of Warsh from Nafi’ and the transmission of Hafs from Asim in terms of tajweed, waqf and ibtida sciences. The aim of the author was to compare the lexical, grammatical, and semantic differences of language events, – at the sound level, i.e. to compare the differences in qira’at based on the transmissions, to show what the difference



in qira'at is. Since both transmissions are valuable linguistic material as a written monument of classical Arabic, which is considered the core of Modern Standard Arabic, they can serve as an invaluable source for scholars studying the phonetic side of the Arabic language.

Keywords: Nafi', Warsh, Asim, Hafs, Qur'an, transmission, Qira'at, Ima-la, Tajweed, Waqf, Ibtida

It is known that the Holy Qur'an has twenty canonical qira'at systems. These qira'at systems have been brought to the present day by twenty *rawis* (transmitters) from ten *qaris* (recitators), two from each. Twenty qira'at systems refer to the qira'at systems learned from one or another of the twenty *rawis*. One and the first of the two most widely qira'at systems of the Holy Qur'an in the world is the qira'at system that Ali b. Abi Talib adopted from the Prophet and Abu Abdurrahman as-Sulami adopted from Ali b. Abi Talib taught to Abu an-Najud, from which it has survived to the present day through Suleyman. The second most widely qira'at system in terms of the development of the Holy Qur'an is the one that he adopted from the Prophet and which Abdullah ibn Abbas adopted from Ubeyy ibn Ka'b and taught to Nafi' Sheyba ibn Nassah that has survived to the present day through Warsh. These two qira'at systems are briefly known as the Hafs from 'Asim and the Warsh from Nafi'. Based on these transmissions, the Holy Qur'an was published and put in the form of a book "between two covers". As it is mentioned, the Hafs transmission from 'Asim is the most widespread, so this or that transmission from the Seven, Ten or Fourteen *qaris* is studied by comparing it with it. 'Asim's Hafs transmission serves as a kind of *standard* in order to reveal the differences between the narrations. From this point of view, the Warsh transmission, which has become a research object since the 11th century, begins to be studied in comparison with the Hafs transmission from the 18th century. The vast majority of studies are in Arabic [Al-Šinqīfī 1979; Ğarrādī 2008; Sāl 2008; Al-Baḥyāwī 2009; Qāsim 2009; Al-Wadḡīrī 2010; Šānūḥa 2016; Ibn Ṭabbāl 2018], two are in Persian [Javāheri 2007; Hajiyan 2013], and one is in Turkish [Kaya 2020].

Meanwhile, Hasan Tahsin Feyizli's work "Muqāranatu riwāyati Warš ma'a riwāyati Ḥafš fī 'ilm al-qirā'a" ("The Comparison of Warsh's and Hafs's Transmissions in 'Ilm al-Qira'at") written in Arabic and published in Istanbul in 2020, attracted the attention of a narrow scientific community studying the recitation of the Qur'an.

The 184-page work consists of a list of abbreviations and symbols, foreword, introduction, three chapters, a list of references and a table of contents.

The first three pages of the work are devoted to a short list of abbreviations and symbols used in the research. In the foreword (p. 5–8), the author provides general information and the recitation of recitations by the companions during the time of the Prophet, the formation of the science of qira'at, and the names of the ten *qaris* are given. It is noted that the transmissions from the seven *qaris* are mutawatir, and the narrations from the three other *qaris* added to this list can also be considered famous and possessed this rank. In the end, the author expresses his gratitude to Dr. Mustafa Aghdemir, Doctor of the Islamic University of Rotterdam, and Qideish al-Kilisi (1911–1984).

In the introduction (pp. 9–24) the author gives general information about Nafi', Galun, Warsh, al-Azraq, as well as 'Asim, shows the isnad of transmissions, explains the recitation tilawat of the Qur'an with tajweed, pays attention to possible errors, and provides a general reference on the pace of qira'at.

Chapter I, consisting of fifteen sub-chapters (p. 25–88), forms the theoretical core of the work and is devoted entirely to the interpretation of the Warsh transmission method by al-Azraq. It should be noted that this part of the research gives a summary of the views expressed so far on the topic under study. Here *istiyaza* and *basmala*, *maddi-sileyi-mimi-jam* that is the type of *madda* that distinguishes the transmission of Warsh from the transmission of Hafṣ, the third person, the singular, *ha-i kinaya*, the ending pronoun denoting the masculine gender, in general, general information about the types of substances (*maddi-tabii*, *maddi-muttasil*, *maddi-munfasil*, *maddi-lazim*, *maddi-ariz*, *maddi-badal*), single hamza (replacement of hamza, fall of hamza, pronunciation of hamza with full realization, displacement of hamza *harakah*, weakening of hamza), two hamzas within the word and at the intersection of words, *idgam* (its types), *idgam*, *izhar*, *iqlab*, *iqfa* cases that is related to *sakin nun* and *tanvin*, also *fath*, *imala* and *taqlil*, the rules that conditioning pronunciation of *ra's* soft (*tarqiq*) and hard (*tafkhim*), *lam's* hard (*tagliz*) and soft (*tarqiq*), *izafi ya-s*, characteristics belong to *waqf* and *ibtida* are studied in the above-mentioned transmission.

Chapter II (p. 89–137) is devoted to the presentation of the differences between the transmissions observed in Surah to Surah. Contrasting

differences are considered sequentially (in the form of a list), rarely with brief comments.

In our opinion, the most valuable chapter of the research is Chapter III (p. 138–174). This chapter is devoted to the least commented alternative qira'at versions of the Warsh transmission. In this chapter, the author managed to fully express himself as a profound connoisseur of the Warsh transmission. Prof. Feyizli successfully interpreted the alternative qira'at options, usually explained in the sources with general theses, with a sufficient number of examples, and was able to clarify the issues that remained obscure.

The list of references (p. 175–177) proves that the author referred to very extensive and authoritative sources.

It should be noted that the author was able to fully achieve the goals set in his research. A comparison of the two narrations was made from the point of view of Tajweed and Waqf and the Qur'anic sciences, the differences between them were revealed, the reason was given, and the differences between the transmissions were shown.

However, we would like to touch upon several important issues related to the work. In the introduction part of the work (p. 9) we would like to take a special look at a moment that draws our attention. The researcher writes that “The transmission of Warsh is studied in the works dedicated to the ten *qaris*, but there is no work that compares and comprehensively studies it with the transmission of Hafṣ”. It is difficult to agree with this conclusion, since the works devoted to comparative analysis (mentioned above) are not only in Arabic, but also in Persian and Turkish. At least, it is possible to give an example from Shanuha's work.

Unfortunately, there are many spelling and orthography errors in the Arabic language in which the book was published. Thus, in the title of the work, hamza (القراءة) which should be written without support, is written with support (القراءة), and throughout the text of the work (except for the verses of the Qur'an), all the alif-maqsuras (e.g., صلى, تعالى, على, يوحى, أدنى, إلى) are written with two dots (e.g., صلى, تعالى, على, يوحى, أدنى, إلى p. 5–6), the letter errors are found as well: نماذج (e.g., p. 138, 143), مختلفة (e.g., p. 143) in the words نماذج and مختلفة.

We would like to draw attention to an opinion that does not reach the level of remarks. The question of why this valuable research is

written in Arabic and not in Turkish, although there is almost no substantive research in Turkish to investigate the problem and there is a sufficient number of works in Arabic depends, I think, on what factors the publication of this valuable research in Arabic remains open.

Another issue, in our opinion, should be touched upon. Unfortunately, the book of Prof. Feyizli is not found in the shops for the purpose, it is possible to get it only through the internet not earlier than two weeks. It is possible to download the majority of the studies in Arab countries on this subject and Mehmet Ali Kaya's research in Turkey in pdf format. It would be expedient to take into account the limited readership of this and other studies analyzing the encounter of Hafs and Warsh qira'at systems in any plane, and to make them available in pdf or similar format for a fee. Considering the pandemic period we live in and the specific and narrow readership of the works, it will be possible to solve the problem of meeting scientific needs in a timely manner.

The points we have mentioned do not completely diminish the value of the work, but adequately address the high scientific requirements of the research, able to shed light on many of the "obscure" aspects of the Warsh transmission from Nafi'.

LITERATURE

Kaya, Mehmet Ali. **Âsim ravilerinden Hafs b. Süleyman ile Nâfi' ravilerinden Verş arasındaki ihtilafı okuyuşların mukâyesesi.** Van: Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi, 2020.

ابن طبال، نعيمة. **التوجيه الصرفي وأثره في المعنى من خلال روايتي حفص وورش الربع الأول أنموذجاً / الرسالة للحصول على درجة ماجستير في اللغة العربية وآدابها.** ورقة، ٢٠١٨.

البيحاوي، مصطفى، حميتو عبد الهادي، العمراوي عبد العزيز. **الدليل الأوفى إلى رواية ورش عن نافع من طريق الأزرق.** الرياض: منشورات وزارة الأوقاف، ٢٠٠٩.

الشنقيطي، محمد الأمين بن محمد المختار الجكني. **أضواء البيان / تحقيق بكر بن عبد الله بوريد: [٧ مجلدات].** جدة: دار عالم الفوائد، ١٩٧٩.

الودغيري، إدريس بن عبد الله الإدريسي الحسيني. **التوضيح والبيان في مقراً الإمام نافع بن عبد الرحمان / تحقيق عبد العزيز العمراوي.** فاس: مطبعة أنفو-برانت، ٢٠١٠.

جرادي، يعرب إبراهيم. **الاختلاف اللغوي وأثره في المعنى. دراسة بين روايتي ورش وحفص.** بسكرة: جامعة محمد خيضر، ٢٠٠٨.

جواهرى، أمير رضا هاشمي. **بررسی تطبیقی روایات حفص (از عاصم) و روایت ورش (از نافع) در قرآنت قرآن کریم / الرسالة للحصول على درجة ماجستير دانشگاه فردوسی مشهد. مشهد، ٢٠٠٧.**

- حاجیان، سعید. تاثیر روایت ورش از قرانت نافع بر دانش تجوید و تفسیر قرآن / الرسالة للحصول على درجة ماجستير كتابخانه دانشكده الهيات و معارف اسلامى. تهران، ۲۰۱۳.
- سال، حلیمه. القراءات: روایتا ورش و حفص. دراسة تحليلية مقارنة. دبي: دار الواضح، ۲۰۰۸.
- شائوچه، عبد الحمید بن منیر. من نور العرش برواية الأزرق عن ورش. بيروت: النشر الإلكتروني، ۲۰۱۶.
- قاسم، محمد عبد الرحمن بن حسين. توجيه الاختلاف النحوي والصرفي وأثره في المعنى بين روایتي حفص عن عاصم وورش عن نافع. الرياض: مكتبة، ۲۰۰۹.

REFERENCES

- Kaya M. (2020), *Âsim ravilerinden Hafş b. Süleyman ile Nâfi' ravilerinden Verş arasındaki ihtilâflı okuyuşların mukâyesesi*, Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi, Van. (In Turkish).
- Ibn Ṭabbāl N. (2018), *Al-tawğīh al-şarfī wa-'ataru-hu fī al-ma'nā min hilāl riwāyatay Hafş wa Warş*, Warqla. (In Arabic).
- Al-Bahyāwī M., Ḥamīti 'A., al-'Umrāwī 'A. (2009), *Al-dalīl al-'awfaq 'ilā riwāyati Warş 'an Nāfi' min ṭariq al-Azraq*, Manşūrāt Wizārat al-awqāf, Riyadh. (In Arabic).
- Al-Şinqīṭī M. (1979), *Aḍwā' al-bayān*, Dār 'Ālim al-fawā'id, Jeddah. (In Arabic).
- Al-Wadğīrī I. (2010), *Al-tawḍīḥ wa-l-bayān fī maqra' al-imām Nāfi' bni 'Abd al-Raḥmān*, Maṭba'at Anfubrant, Fez. (In Arabic).
- Ġarrādī Ya. (2008), *Al-iḥtilāf al-luğawī wa-'ataru-hu fī al-ma'nā. Dirāsa bayna riwāyatay Warş wa Hafş*, Muḥammad Khider University, Biskra. (In Arabic).
- Javāheri A. (2007), *Barrasiye tatbiqiye revayāte Hafş (az Asem) va revāyate Varş (az Nāfe') dar qerā'ate Qor'āne karim*, Dānešgāhe Ferdowsi, Mašhad. (In Persian).
- Hājiyān S. (2013), *Ta'sire revayāte Varş az qerā'ate Nāfe' bar dāneše tajvide va tafsire Qor'an*, Dāneškadeye elāhiyyāt va ma'ārefe eslāmi, Tehrān. (In Persian).
- Sāl H. (2008), *Al-qirā'āt: riwāyatā Warş wa-Hafş. Dirāsa taḥlīliyya muqārīna*, Dār al-Wāḍiḥ, Dubai. (In Arabic).
- Şānūḥa 'A. (2016), *Min Nūr al-'arş bi-riwāyat al-Azraq 'an Warş*, Al-Našr al-Ilīkrūnī, Beirut. (In Arabic).
- Qāsim M. (2009), *Tawğīh al-iḥtilāf al-naḥwī wa-l-şarfī wa-'ataru-hu fī al-ma'nā bayna riwāyatay Hafş 'an 'Āsim wa Warş 'an Nāfi'*, Maktaba, Riyadh. (In Arabic).